

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----X

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA :

– *against* – :

06 Cr. 1054 (RMB)

JAVED IQBAL and :

FILED ELECTRONICALLY

SALEH ELAHWAL, :

Defendants.

-----X

**JOINT MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT
OF DEFENDANTS' PRE-TRIAL MOTIONS**

– Of Counsel –
Joshua L. Dratel
Renita K. Thukral

Joshua L. Dratel, Esq.
Law Offices of Joshua L. Dratel, P.C.
2 Wall Street, 3rd floor
New York, NY 10005
(212) 732-0707
Attorneys for Defendant Javed Iqbal

Edward V. Sapone, Esq.
Law Office of Edward V. Sapone
1 Penn Plaza, Suite 5315
New York, NY 10119
(212) 974-0600
Attorney for Defendant Saleh Elahwal

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents i

Table of Authorities iii

Introduction 1

Statement of the Facts 1

POINT I

THE “MATERIAL SUPPORT” COUNTS (1,2, 7 & 8)
SHOULD BE DISMISSED BECAUSE (A) THEY FAIL
TO STATE AN OFFENSE UNDER THE STATUTE,
18 U.S.C. §2339B; (B) THE CONDUCT ALLEGED IS
EXEMPTED FROM §2339B; AND/OR (C) §2339B IS
UNCONSTITUTIONALLY VAGUE ON ITS FACE OR
AS APPLIED, AND IS UNCONSTITUTIONALLY OVERBROAD 1

POINT II

COUNTS 3-6 & 9-11 SHOULD BE DISMISSED BECAUSE
(A) THE INDICTMENT FAILS TO ALLEGE ANY
SUBSTANTIVE OFFENSE; (B) THE CONDUCT ALLEGED
IS EXEMPTED FROM 22 U.S.C. §287c, AND/OR BECAUSE
THE STATUTE IS UNCONSTITUTIONALLY VAGUE AS
APPLIED, AND/OR IS UNCONSTITUTIONALLY OVERBROAD 25

POINT III

THE MULTIPLICITOUS COUNTS IN THE
INDICTMENT VIOLATE THE FIFTH AMENDMENT
PROHIBITION AGAINST DOUBLE JEOPARDY AND MUST BE DISMISSED 29

POINT IV

STATEMENTS MADE BY MR. IQBAL ON AUGUST 23, 2006, AND
ANY AND ALL FRUITS THEREOF, SHOULD BE SUPPRESSED,
AND/OR A HEARING CONDUCTED TO DETERMINE WHETHER
THEY WERE VOLUNTARY 31

POINT V

ALL PROPERTY SEIZED DURING THE SEARCHES OF MR. IQBAL’S
RESIDENCE, BUSINESS, AND CAR SHOULD BE SUPPRESSED,
AND/OR A HEARING CONDUCTED TO DETERMINE WHETHER
THEY WERE VOLUNTARY 38

POINT VI

THE INDICTMENT SHOULD BE DISMISSED BECAUSE
MR. IQBAL AND DR. ELAHWAL HAVE BEEN SUBJECT
TO SELECTIVE PROSECUTION, OR, IN THE ALTERNATIVE,
THE COURT SHOULD CONDUCT A HEARING 43

POINT VII

THE COURT SHOULD GRANT MR. ELAHWAL A SEVERANCE
BECAUSE OTHERWISE HE WILL SUFFER UNDUE PREJUDICE
IF TRIED JOINTLY WITH MR. IQBAL, AGAINST WHOM THE
MAJORITY OF THE GOVERNMENT’S EVIDENCE, IS DIRECTED,
AND WHOSE STATEMENTS CREATE A *BRUTON* ISSUE 46

POINT VIII

THE COURT SHOULD COMPEL THE GOVERNMENT
TO PRODUCE THE DEMANDED DISCOVERY,
BRADY MATERIAL, AND BILL OF PARTICULARS 48

Regarding Counts 1, 2, 7 & 8 49

Regarding Counts 3, 4, 5, 6, 9, 10 & 11 49

Conclusion 50

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES

<i>Acceptance Ins. Co. v. Sloan</i> , 263 F.3d 278 (3d Cir.2001)	23
<i>Advance Pharm., Inc. v. United States</i> , 391 F.3d 377 (2d Cir. 2004)	13
<i>American Booksellers Foundation v. Dean</i> , 342 F.3d 96 (2d Cir. 2003)	15,16
<i>Anobile v. Pelligrino</i> , 303 F.3d 107 (2d Cir. 2002)	40
<i>Ball v. United States</i> , 470 U.S. 856 (1985)	30
<i>Berkemer v. McCarty</i> , 468 U.S. 420 (1984)	32
<i>Blockberger v. United States</i> , 284 U.S. 299 (1932)	30
<i>Board of Trustees v. Fox</i> , 492 U.S. 469 (1989)	16
<i>Boim v. Quranic Literacy Institute, et al.</i> , 291 F.3d 1000 (7 th Cir. 2002)	7,11
<i>Brandenburg v. Ohio</i> , 395 U.S. 444 (1969)	8,9,10
<i>Broadrick v. Okla.</i> , 413 U.S. 601 (1973)	15,20
<i>Brockett v. Spokane Arcades, Inc.</i> , 472 U.S. 491 (1985)	16
<i>Bruton v. United States</i> , 391 U.S. 123 (1968)	48
<i>California v. Beheler</i> , 463 U.S. 1121 (1983)	32,33
<i>Capital Cities/ABC, Inc. v. Brady</i> , 740 F. Supp. 1007 (S.D.N.Y. 1990)	27
<i>Cernuda v. Heavey</i> , 720 F. Supp. 1544 (S.D. Fla. 1989)	28,29,30
<i>Chapman v. United States</i> , 500 U.S. 453 (1991)	12
<i>Citizens Against Rent Control Coalition for Fair Housing</i> <i>v. Berkeley</i> , 454 U.S. 290 (1981)	11
<i>Coates v. City of Cincinnati</i> , 402 U.S. 611 (1971)	13
<i>Colorado v. Connelly</i> , 479 U.S. 157 (1986)	33

<i>Coolidge v. New Hampshire</i> , 403 U.S. 443 (1971)	41
<i>Crawford v. Washington</i> , 541 U.S. 36 (2004)	48
<i>De Jonge v. Oregon</i> , 299 U.S. 353 (1937)	11,19
<i>Farrell v. Burke</i> , 449 F.3d 470 (2d Cir. 2006)	13,14,15,16
<i>Franks v. Delaware</i> , 438 U.S. 154 (1978)	41,42
<i>Grayned v. City of Rockford</i> , 408 U.S. 104 (1972)	13,15
<i>Green v. Scully</i> , 850 F.2d 894 (2d Cir.1988)	34
<i>Hess v. Indiana</i> , 414 U.S. 105 (1973)	8,10
<i>Humanitarian Law Project v. Reno</i> , 205 F.3d 1130 (9th Cir.2000) (hereinafter “HLP I”)	3
<i>Humanitarian Law Project v. Ashcroft</i> , 352 F.3d 382 (9 th Cir. 2003) (hereinafter “HLP II”)	3,6,7,8,14,15
<i>Humanitarian Law Project v. U.S. Dept. Of Justice</i> , 352 F.3d 382 (9 th Cir. 2003), <i>vacated on other grounds by</i> 393 F.2d 902 (9 th Cir. 2004) (hereinafter “HLP III”)	7,8,17
<i>Humanitarian Law Project v. U.S. Dept. Of Justice</i> , 2004 WL 547534 (C.D. Cal. March 17, 2004) (hereinafter “HLP IV”)	7,17
<i>INS v. Phinpathya</i> , 464 U.S. 183 (1984)	22
<i>Jones v. United States</i> , 526 U.S. 227 (1999)	12
<i>Kaplan v. County of Los Angeles</i> , 894 F.2d 1076 (9 th Cir. 1990)	11
<i>Kolender v. Lawson</i> , 461 U.S. 352 (1983)	14
<i>Lo-J Sales, Inc. v. New York</i> , 442 U.S. 319 (1979)	42
<i>Mcnabb v. United States</i> , 318 U.S. 332 (1943)	36,37
<i>Mallory v. United States</i> , 354 U.S. 449 (1957)	36,37

<i>Maryland v. Garrison</i> , 480 U.S. 79 (1987)	41
<i>Michigan v. Tyler</i> , 436 U.S. 499 (1978)	41
<i>Mills v. Alabama</i> , 384 U.S. 214 (1966)	11
<i>Miranda v. Arizona</i> , 384 U.S. 436 (1966)	31,32,33
<i>Missouri v. Seibert</i> , 542 U.S. 600 (2004)	33,35,36
<i>Moran v. Burbine</i> , 475 U.S. 412 (1986)	34,35
<i>NAACP v. Claiborne Hardware Co.</i> , 458 U.S. 886 (1982)	10,11,19
<i>Nelson v. Walker</i> , 121 F.3d 828 (2d Cir.1997)	34
<i>New York Times v. Sullivan</i> , 376 U.S. 254 (1964)	17,19
<i>New York Times v. United States</i> , 403 U.S. 713 (1971)	17
<i>Noto v. United States</i> , 367 U.S. 290 (1961)	9,18
<i>Oregon v. Elstad</i> , 470 U.S. 298 (1985)	35
<i>Parker v. Levy</i> , 417 U.S. 733 (1974)	17
<i>Parsad v. Greiner</i> , 337 F.3d 175 (2d Cir. 2003)	35
<i>Payton v. New York</i> , 445 U.S. 573 (1980)	41
<i>Planned Parenthood of the Columbia/Willamette Inc. v. American Coalition of Life Activists</i> , 244 F.3d 1007 (9 th Cir. 2001) (hereinafter “ <i>PPCW I</i> ”), vacated on other grounds by 290 F.3d 1058 (9 th Cir. 2002) (hereinafter “ <i>PPCW II</i> ”)	8,19,20
<i>Russell v. United States</i> , 369 U.S. 749 (1962)	2
<i>Scales v. United States</i> , 367 U.S. 203 (1961)	11,18
<i>Schneckloth v. Bustamonte</i> , 412 U.S. 218 (1973)	39
<i>Shelton v. Tucker</i> , 364 U.S. 479 (1960)	11
<i>Singh-Kaur v. United States</i> , 385 F.3d 293 (3d Cir. 2004)	20,21,22,23

<i>Standsbury v. California</i> , 511 U.S. 318 (1994)	33
<i>Stanford v. Texas</i> , 379 U.S. 476 (1965)	42
<i>Steagald v. United States</i> , 451 U.S. 204 (1981)	41
<i>Steele v. United States</i> , 267 U.S. 498 (1925)	41
<i>Tankleff v. Senkowski</i> , 135 F.3d 235 (2d Cir.1998)	35
<i>Texas v. Johnson</i> , 491 U.S. 397 (1989)	19
<i>Thornhill v. Alabama</i> , 310 U.S. 88 (1940)	15
<i>Triestman v. United States</i> , 124 F.3d 361 (2d Cir. 1997)	12
<i>Turner Broadcast System v. FCC</i> , 512 U.S. 622 (1994)	14
<i>United States v. Al-Arian</i> , 308 F. Supp.2d 1322 (M.D. Fla. 2004)	3
<i>United States v. Al-Arian</i> , 329 F. Supp.2d 1294 (M.D. Fla. 2004)	12
<i>United States v. Ali</i> , 68 F.3d 1468 (2d Cir. 1995), <i>modified on rehearing</i> , 86 F.3d 275 (1996)	32,33
<i>United States v. Alvarez-Sanchez</i> , 511 U.S. 350 (1994)	37
<i>United States v. Anderson</i> , 929 F.2d 96 (2d Cir.1991)	35
<i>United States v. Berkovich</i> , 932 F.Supp. 582 (S.D.N.Y. 1996)	38
<i>United States v. Bortnovsky</i> , 820 F.2d 572 (2d Cir. 1987)	48
<i>United States v. Calvente</i> , 722 F2d 1019 (2d Cir. 1983)	39
<i>United States v. Chacko</i> , 169 F.3d 140 (2d Cir. 1999)	30
<i>United States v. Colon</i> , 835 F.2d 27 (2d Cir. 1987)	37
<i>United States v. Davidoff</i> , 845 F.2d 1151 (2d Cir. 1988)	48
<i>United States ex rel. Attorney General, v. Delaware & Hudson Co.</i> , 213 U.S. 366 (1909)	12

<i>United States v. Dixon</i> , 509 U.S. 688 (1993)	30
<i>United States v. Dolan</i> , 113 F. Supp. 757 (D. Conn. 1953)	49
<i>United States v. Duvall</i> , 537 F.2d 15 (2d Cir. 1976)	35
<i>United States v. Fares</i> , 978 F.2d 52 (2d Cir. 1992)	44,46
<i>United States v. Figueroa</i> , 618 F.2d 934 (2d Cir. 1980)	47
<i>United States v. Fullwood</i> , 86 F.3d 27 (2d Cir. 1996)	38
<i>United States v. Garcia</i> , 56 F.3d. 418 (2d Cir. 1995)	40
<i>United States v. George</i> , 975 F.2d 72 (2d Cir. 1992)	41
<i>United States v. Giese</i> , 597 F.2d 1170 (9 th Cir. 1979)	42,43
<i>United States v. Hammoud</i> , 381 F.3d 316 (4 th Cir. 2004), <i>remanded for resentencing on other grounds</i> , 405 F.3d 1034 (4 th Cir. 2005)	7
<i>United States v. Hodge</i> , 321 F.3d 429 (3d Cir.2003)	23
<i>United States v. Isiofia</i> , 370 F.3d 226 (2d Cir. 2004)	39
<i>United States v. Josephberg</i> , 459 F.3d 350 (2d Cir. 2006)	30
<i>United States v. Khan</i> , 309 F. Supp.2d 789 (E.D. Va. 2004)	8,12
<i>United States v. Leon</i> , 468 U.S. 1250 (1984)	42
<i>United States v. Loy</i> , 237 F.3d 251 (2d Cir. 2001)	14
<i>United States v. Male Juvenile</i> , 121 F.3d 34 (2d Cir.1997)	34
<i>United States v. Mitchell</i> , 966 F.2d 92 (2d Cir. 1992)	32
<i>United States v. Moon</i> , 718 F.2d 1210 (2d Cir. 1983), <i>cert. denied</i> , 466 U.S. 971 (1984)	44,45
<i>United States v. Moreno</i> , 897 F.2d 26 (2d Cir. 1990)	40
<i>United States v. Morison</i> , 844 F.2d 1057 (4 th Cir. 1988)	17

<i>United States v. O'Brien</i> , 391 U.S. 367 (1968)	14,17
<i>United States v. Panarella</i> , 227 F.3d 678 (3d Cir. 2000)	4
<i>United States v. Perez</i> , 733 F.2d 1026 (2d Cir. 1984)	37
<i>United States v. Philippe</i> , 173 F. Supp. 582 (S.D.N.Y. 1959)	49
<i>United States v. Pirro</i> , 212 F.3d 86 (2d Cir. 2000)	2
<i>United States v. Rahman</i> , 189 F.3d 88 (2d Cir. 1999)	15
<i>United States v. Rosen</i> , 445 F. Supp.2d 602 (E.D. Va. 2006)	16,17
<i>United States v. Sattar</i> , 314 F. Supp.2d 279 (S.D.N.Y. 2004) (hereinafter " <i>Sattar II</i> ")	3,6,20,45
<i>United States v. Sattar</i> , 272 F. Supp.2d 348 (S.D.N.Y. 2003) (hereinafter " <i>Sattar I</i> ")	3,6,14,17
<i>United States v. Seeger</i> , 303 F.2d 478 (2d Cir. 1962)	26
<i>United States v. Spinelli</i> , 352 F.3d 48 (2d Cir. 2003)	47
<i>United States v. Vanwort</i> , 887 F.2d 375 (2d Cir.1989)	47
<i>United States v. Vargas</i> , 621 F.2d 54 (2d Cir.), <i>cert. denied</i> , 449 U.S. 854 (1980)	41
<i>United States v. Walker</i> , 142 F.3d 103 (2nd Cir. 1998)	47
<i>United States v. Walsh</i> , 194 F.3d 37 (2d Cir. 1999)	2
<i>United States v. Wayte</i> , 470 U.S. 598 (1985)	44,46
<i>Virginia v. Hicks</i> , 539 U.S. 113 (2003)	20
<i>Ward v. Rock Against Racism</i> , 491 U.S. 781 (1989)	14
<i>Wong Sun v. United States</i> , 371 U.S. 471 (1963)	38,43
<i>Yick Wo v. Hopkins</i> , 118 U.S. 356 (1886)	45,46

<i>Young v. Am. Mini Theatres, Inc.</i> , 427 U.S. 50 (1976)	14
<i>Zafiro v. United States</i> , 506 U.S. 534 (1993)	47
<i>Zurcher v. Stanford Daily</i> , 436 U.S. 547 (1978)	41

STATUTES

Amend. I, U.S. Const.	<i>passim</i>
Amend. IV, U.S. Const.	39,40,41,43
Amend. V, U.S. Const.	2,13,29,30 31,36,46
Amend. VI, U.S. Const.	2,48
18 U.S.C. §371	25,26
18 U.S.C. §2339A	12
18 U.S.C. §2339A(b)	2,3
18 U.S.C. §2339A(b)(1)	12,49
18 U.S.C. §2339B	<i>passim</i>
18 U.S.C. §2339B(a)(1)	2
18 U.S.C. §2339B(i)	5,8,12,18,27,29
18 U.S.C. §3501	31
18 U.S.C. §3501(c)	36,37
22 U.S.C. §287c, (United Nations Participation Act)	25,26,27,29,30
22 U.S.C. §287c(a)	26
22 U.S.C. §287c(b)	26
50 U.S.C. §5(b)(4) (Trading With the Enemy Act)	27

50 U.S.C. §1702(b)	28,29,30
50 U.S.C. §1702(b)(3)	27
50 U.S.C. §1702(b)(4)	27
50 U.S.C. §1705(b), (International Emergency Economic Powers Act)	27
Executive Order 13224	26,28,29,30
Rule 5(a), Fed.R.Crim.P.	36,37
Rule 5(a)(1)(A), Fed.R.Crim.P.	36
Rule 5(c), Fed.R.Crim.P.	36
Rule 5(c)(1), Fed.R.Crim.P.	36
Rule 14, Fed.R.Crim.P.	46,47
Rule 16, Fed.R.Crim.P.	47,48
31 C.F.R. Part 594	26
31 C.F.R. §594.305	27,28

OTHER AUTHORITIES

Testimony of Attorney General John Ashcroft before the House Judiciary Committee in June 2003, <i>The Justice Department and the USA PATRIOT Act: Hearing Before the House Comm. On the Judiciary</i> , 107 th Cong. (2003), available at 2003 WL 21291138	20,21
<i>Black's Law Dictionary</i> (7 th ed. 1999)	22
Robert M. Chesney, <i>Civil Liberties and the Terrorism Prevention Paradigm: The Guilt By Association Critique</i> , 101 Mich. L. Rev. 1410 (2003)	24
Congressional Record Service, "Material Support of Terrorists and Foreign Terrorist Organizations: Sunset Amendments," Updated March 17, 2007 (RL33035) (Charles Doyle, Senior Specialist, American Law Division)	3,17,24

H.R. Rep. 103-482 (1994)	28
H.R. Rep. No. 104-383 (1996)	6
9 Writings of James Madison 103 (G. Hunt ed.1910)	17
John Stuart Mill, <i>On Liberty</i> (1 st ed. 1859)	19,20
Andrew Peterson, <i>Addressing Tomorrow's Terrorists</i> , 2 J. Nat'l Security & Pol'y ____	4,5,22,23,24
P.L. 103-236 §525 (Foreign Relations Authorization Act)	27
Margaret D. Stock, <i>Providing Material Support to a Foreign Terrorist Organization: The Pentagon, The Department of State, the People's Mujahedin of Iran, & the Global War On Terrorism</i> , Bender's Immigration Bulletin (2006)	21,23,24
United States Attorney's Manual	7,8
<i>Webster's Third New Int'l Dictionary</i> (1981)	22